

---

ATTI ACCADEMIA NAZIONALE DEI LINCEI  
CLASSE SCIENZE FISICHE MATEMATICHE NATURALI  
**RENDICONTI**

---

FRANCESCO S. DE BLASI, JOHN SCHINAS

**Exponential stability of difference equations which  
cannot be linearized**

*Atti della Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei. Classe di Scienze Fisiche,  
Matematiche e Naturali. Rendiconti, Serie 8, Vol. 54 (1973), n.1, p. 16–21.*

Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei

<[http://www.bdim.eu/item?id=RLINA\\_1973\\_8\\_54\\_1\\_16\\_0](http://www.bdim.eu/item?id=RLINA_1973_8_54_1_16_0)>

L'utilizzo e la stampa di questo documento digitale è consentito liberamente per motivi di ricerca e studio. Non è consentito l'utilizzo dello stesso per motivi commerciali. Tutte le copie di questo documento devono riportare questo avvertimento.

---

*Articolo digitalizzato nel quadro del programma  
bdim (Biblioteca Digitale Italiana di Matematica)  
SIMAI & UMI*

<http://www.bdim.eu/>

**Analisi matematica.** — *Exponential stability of difference equations which cannot be linearized.* Nota di FRANCESCO S. DE BLASI (\*) e JOHN SCHINAS (\*\*), presentata (\*\*) dal Socio G. SANSONE.

RIASSUNTO. — Si considera l'equazione  $\Delta x(t) = f(x(t-1))$  e si dimostra che, se  $f$  ha differenziale multivoco  $D_f$  in  $x = 0$  e tutte le soluzioni di  $\Delta x(t) \in D_f(x(t-1))$  tendono all'origine, allora quest'ultima è localmente esponenzialmente stabile per l'equazione data.

1. It is well known (see [2] Ch. V, § 43) that if  $f: E^n \rightarrow E^n$  is continuously differentiable, with Fréchet differential  $A$  at  $x = 0$ , and if all solutions of the linear difference equation

$$(1) \quad \Delta x(t) = Ax(t-1) \quad , \quad \Delta x(t) = x(t) - x(t-1),$$

approach zero as  $t \rightarrow \infty$ , the origin is locally exponentially stable for

$$(2) \quad \Delta x(t) = f(x(t-1)).$$

The aim of this paper is to extend the previous result to the case in which  $f$  is not necessarily Fréchet differentiable at the origin. For differential equations such problem has been treated in a recent work by Lasota and Strauss ([3]), who have introduced for this purpose the concept of multivalued differential. The definition of the multivalued differential  $D_f$  of  $f$ , that we shall use, is essentially the same with the difference that  $D_f(x)$ ,  $x \in E^n$ , will be required to be a nonempty compact subset of  $E^n$  without the additional hypothesis of convexity, which occurs in [3]. If  $f$  has Fréchet differential  $A$  at the origin, we have  $D_f(x) = \{Ax\}$ ,  $x \in E^n$ . We shall prove the following generalization of the aforementioned result:

If  $f$  has multivalued differential  $D_f$  at  $x = 0$  (see next paragraph) and if all solutions of the multivalued difference equation

$$(3) \quad \Delta x(t) \in D_f(x(t-1))$$

approach zero as  $t \rightarrow \infty$ , then the origin is locally exponentially stable for equation (2).

The proof of this result can be described as the discrete analogue of a corresponding one, devised by Lasota and Strauss in the case of ordinary differential equations. It actually depends on certain perturbation theorems

(\*) This paper was written while both Authors were at the University of Warwick, Coventry, England, with the financial assistance of a N.A.T.O. fellowship.

(\*\*) Nella seduta del 13 gennaio 1973.

for multivalued difference equations, which have been established in [1]. Other applications of multivalued difference equations can be found in [4].

2. Denote by:  $N_{t_0} = \{t_0, t_0 + 1, \dots\}$ , where  $t_0$  is any natural number or zero;  $E^n$  the  $n$ -dimensional real Euclidean space with norm  $|\cdot|$ ;  $B(r)$  the closed ball with center the origin of  $E^n$  and radius  $r \geq 0$ ;  $\|X\| = \sup \{|x| : x \in X\}$ , where  $X$  is a nonempty and bounded subset of  $E^n$ ;  $K^n$  the family of all nonempty compact subsets of  $E^n$ . In  $K^n$  addition and multiplication by nonnegative scalars are defined by  $X + Y = \{x + y : x \in X, y \in Y\}$ ,  $\lambda X = \{\lambda x : x \in X\}$ . We shall denote by  $\Phi$  the family of all uppersemicontinuous functions  $F : E^n \rightarrow K^n$  and by  $\chi$  the subfamily of  $\Phi$  consisting of all homogeneous functions, i.e. of all  $F$  such that  $F(\lambda x) = \lambda F(x)$ , for all  $x \in E^n$  and  $\lambda \geq 0$ .

DEFINITION 1. Let  $F : E^n \rightarrow K^n$ . We say that  $F$  is locally Lipschitz at  $x = 0$  if there exist positive constants  $L$  and  $\delta$  such that

$$\|F(x)\| \leq L|x| \quad \text{for all } |x| \leq \delta.$$

If  $\delta = \infty$ ,  $F$  is called globally Lipschitz at  $x = 0$ .

DEFINITION 2. Let  $F \in \Phi$  be locally (globally) Lipschitz at  $x = 0$ . A function  $\varphi \in \chi$  is called a local (global) upper differential of  $F$  if there exists a  $\delta > 0$ , ( $\delta = \infty$ ) such that

$$F(x) \subset \varphi(x) \quad \text{for all } |x| \leq \delta \quad (\text{for all } x \in E^n).$$

Note that if  $F \in \Phi$  is locally (globally) Lipschitz at  $x = 0$ ,  $\varphi(x) = LB(|x|)$  is a local (global) upper differential of  $F$ .

DEFINITION 3. Let  $F \in \Phi$  be locally Lipschitz at  $x = 0$ . We define the multivalued differential  $D_F$  of  $F$  by

$$D_F(x) = \cap \{\varphi(x) : \varphi \text{ is a local upper differential of } F\}, \quad x \in E^n.$$

The multivalued differential  $D_F^*$  of a function  $F$  which is globally Lipschitz at  $x = 0$ , is defined by

$$D_F^*(x) = \cap \{\varphi(x) : \varphi \text{ is a global upper differential of } F\}, \quad x \in E^n.$$

It is clear that the preceding definitions apply in particular to single valued functions  $f : E^n \rightarrow E^n$ . For the function  $f : E^2 \rightarrow E^2$  given by  $(\frac{1}{2}(x_1^2 + x_2^2)^{1/2} \sin(x_1^2 + x_2^2)^{-1/2}, \frac{1}{2}(x_1^2 + x_2^2)^{1/2})$ ,  $(x_1, x_2) \in E^2$ , one can easily verify that

$$D_f(x_1, x_2) = D_f^*(x_1, x_2) = \left( \left[ -\frac{1}{2}(x_1^2 + x_2^2)^{1/2}, \frac{1}{2}(x_1^2 + x_2^2)^{1/2} \right], \frac{1}{2}(x_1^2 + x_2^2)^{1/2} \right), \quad (x_1, x_2) \in E^2.$$

Using the same argument as in Lemma 2.8 of [3], one can prove the following

LEMMA 1. *Let  $F \in \Phi$  be locally (globally) Lipschitz at  $x = 0$ . Then  $D_F \in \chi$  ( $D_F^* \in \chi$ ). Furthermore, there exists a sequence  $\{\varphi_k\}$  of local (global) upper differentials such that*

$$\varphi_{k+1}(x) \subset \varphi_k(x) \quad \text{for every } x \in E^n \quad \text{and } k = 1, 2, \dots$$

$$D_F(x) = \bigcap_{k=1}^{\infty} \varphi_k(x) \quad , \quad \left( D_F^*(x) = \bigcap_{k=1}^{\infty} \varphi_k(x) \right), \quad x \in E^n.$$

Note that if  $F \in \Phi$  is globally Lipschitz at  $x = 0$ , we have  $D_F(x) \subset CD_F^*(x)$ ,  $x \in E^n$ .

DEFINITION 4. Assume that  $f: E^n \rightarrow E^n$  is continuous and locally Lipschitz at  $x = 0$ . The function  $h: E^n \rightarrow E^n$  is called a homogeneous differential of  $f$  at  $x = 0$ , if  $h$  is homogeneous and continuous and

$$|f(x) - h(x)| = o(|x|) \quad \text{as } |x| \rightarrow 0.$$

The homogeneous differential is unique ([3]).

LEMMA 2. *Assume that  $f: E^n \rightarrow E^n$  is continuous and locally Lipschitz at  $x = 0$ . If  $f$  has homogeneous differential  $h$ , then  $D_f$  is single valued and we have  $D_f(x) = \{h(x)\}$ ,  $x \in E^n$ ; conversely if  $D_f$  is single valued,  $f$  has homogeneous differential  $h$  and  $D_f(x) = \{h(x)\}$ ,  $x \in E^n$ . In particular  $f$  is Fréchet differentiable if and only if, for some matrix  $A$ ,  $D_f(x) = \{Ax\}$ ,  $x \in E^n$ .*

The proof of Lemma 2 is given in [3].

3. Consider the multivalued difference equation

$$(4) \quad \Delta x(t) \in F(x(t-1)).$$

DEFINITION 5. Let  $t_0 \in N_0$ ,  $x_0 \in E^n$ . A function  $x: N_{t_0} \rightarrow E^n$  is called solution of (4) if  $x(t_0) = x_0$  and  $x(t)$  satisfies (4) for all  $t \in N_{t_0+1}$ .

Note that, for any  $t_0 \in N_0$  and  $x_0 \in E^n$ , (4) has at least one solution  $x(t)$ , with  $x(t_0) = x_0$ .

To prove our main results we shall use the following Lemmas which can be found in [1].

LEMMA 3. *Suppose that:*

(i)  $\{F_k\}$  is an infinite sequence of functions in  $\chi$  such that  $F_{k+1}(x) \subset F_k(x)$ , for all  $x \in E^n$ ,  $k \in N_1$ , and define  $F(x) = \bigcap_{k=1}^{\infty} F_k(x)$ ;

(ii) all solutions  $x(t)$  of (4), with  $x(0) \in E^n$ , approach zero as  $t \rightarrow \infty$ .

Then there exist  $k \in N_1$  and  $L \geq 1$  such that every solution  $x(t)$  of

$$(5_k) \quad \Delta x(t) \in F_k(x(t-1)),$$

with  $x(0) \in E^n$ , satisfies  $|x(t)| \leq L|x(0)|$ , for all  $t \in N_0$ .

LEMMA 4. Let  $F \in \chi$ . Suppose that there exist  $\varepsilon > 0$  and  $H \geq 1$  such that any solution  $x(t)$  of

$$\Delta x(t) \in F(x(t-1)) + \varepsilon B(|x(t-1)|),$$

with  $x(0) \in E^n$ , satisfies  $|x(t)| \leq H|x(0)|$ ,  $t \in N_0$ . Let  $0 \leq \sigma < \varepsilon$ . Then, for every solution  $x(t)$  of

$$\Delta x(t) \in F(x(t-1)) + \sigma B(|x(t-1)|),$$

with  $x(0) \in E^n$ , we have  $|x(t)| \leq H|x(0)|\rho^{-t}$ ,  $t \in N_0$ ,  $1 < \rho \leq 1 + (\varepsilon - \sigma)H^{-1}$ .

LEMMA 5. Suppose that:

(i) every solution  $x(t)$  of (4), where  $x(0) \in E^n$  and  $F \in \chi$ , approaches zero as  $t \rightarrow \infty$ ;

(ii)  $G \in \Phi$  is such that  $\|G(x)\| = o(|x|)$  as  $|x| \rightarrow 0$ .

Then there exist constants  $\delta > 0$ ,  $M \geq 1$  and  $\rho > 1$  such that, for any solution  $x(t)$  of

$$\Delta x(t) \in F(x(t-1)) + G(x(t-1)),$$

if  $|x(0)| < \delta$ , we have  $|x(t)| \leq M|x(0)|\rho^{-t}$ ,  $t \in N_0$ .

4. This paragraph contains our main results.

THEOREM 1. Let  $F \in \Phi$  be locally Lipschitz at  $x = 0$ . If all solutions  $x(t)$  of

$$\Delta x(t) \in D_F(x(t-1)),$$

with  $x(0) \in E^n$ , satisfy  $x(t) \rightarrow 0$  as  $t \rightarrow \infty$ , then there exist constants  $\delta > 0$ ,  $M \geq 1$  and  $\rho > 1$  such that all solutions  $x(t)$  of (4), with  $|x(0)| < \delta$ , satisfy  $|x(t)| \leq M|x(0)|\rho^{-t}$ ,  $t \in N_0$ .

*Proof.* Let  $\{\varphi_k\}$  be the sequence which corresponds to  $D_F$  according to Lemma 1 and define

$$F_k(x) = \varphi_k(x) + \frac{1}{k} B(|x|), \quad x \in E^n, \quad k \in N_1.$$

Observe that for all  $k \in N_1$ ,  $F_k \in \chi$ ,  $F_{k+1}(x) \supset F_k(x)$  and  $\bigcap_{k=1}^{\infty} F_k(x) = D_F(x)$ .

From Lemma 3 there exist  $k \in N_1$  and  $L \geq 1$  such that every solution  $x(t)$  of

$$\Delta x(t) \in \varphi_k(x(t-1)) + \frac{1}{k} B(|x(t-1)|),$$

with  $x(0) \in E^n$ , satisfies  $|x(t)| \leq L|x(0)|$ ,  $t \in N_0$ . Applying Lemma 4 to this equation and choosing  $\sigma = 0$ , we can find that all solutions  $x(t)$  of

$$(6) \quad \Delta x(t) \in \varphi_k(x(t-1)),$$

with  $x(0) \in E^n$ , approach zero exponentially as  $t \rightarrow \infty$ . From Definition 2 there exists a  $\delta_k > 0$  such that  $F(x) \subset \varphi_k(x)$  if  $|x| \leq \delta_k$ . Define  $G: E^n \rightarrow K^n$  by:

$$G(x) = \begin{cases} \{0\}, & \text{if } |x| < \delta_k \\ B(\|F(x)\| + \|\varphi_k(x)\|), & \text{if } |x| \geq \delta_k. \end{cases}$$

Clearly

$$(7) \quad F(x) \subset \varphi_k(x) + G(x) \quad \text{for all } x \in E^n.$$

Moreover  $G \in \Phi$  and  $\|G(x)\| = o(|x|)$  as  $x \rightarrow 0$ . So, from Lemma 5, there exist constants  $\delta > 0$ ,  $M \geq 1$  and  $\rho > 1$  such that, for any solution  $x(t)$  of

$$\Delta x(t) \in \varphi_k(x(t-1)) + G(x(t-1)),$$

if  $|x(0)| < \delta$ , we have  $|x(t)| \leq M|x(0)|\rho^{-t}$ ,  $t \in N_0$ . Because of (7) this conclusion holds in particular for all solutions  $x(t)$  of (4) with  $|x(0)| < \delta$ . This completes the proof.

**THEOREM 2.** *Let  $F \in \Phi$  be globally Lipschitz at  $x = 0$ . If all solutions  $x(t)$  of*

$$\Delta x(t) \in D_F^*(x(t-1)),$$

*with  $x(0) \in E^n$ , satisfy  $x(t) \rightarrow 0$  as  $t \rightarrow \infty$ , then there exist constants  $H \geq 1$  and  $\rho > 1$  such that solutions  $x(t)$  of (4), with  $x(0) \in E^n$ , satisfy  $|x(t)| \leq H|x(0)|\rho^{-t}$ ,  $t \in N_0$ .*

*Proof.* Denote by  $\{\varphi_k\}$  the sequence which corresponds to  $D_F^*$  according to Lemma 1. By the same argument of Theorem 1 we find that all solutions  $x(t)$  of (6), with  $x(0) \in E^n$ , satisfy  $|x(t)| \leq H|x(0)|\rho^{-t}$ ,  $t \in N_0$ , where  $H \geq 1$  and  $\rho > 1$  are the constants in Lemma 4. The last inequality is in particular true for all solutions  $x(t)$  of (4), with  $x(0) \in E^n$ , since  $\varphi_k(x) \supset F(x)$  for all  $x \in E^n$ .

When  $F$  is single valued from the preceding Theorems we have:

**COROLLARY 1.** *Let  $f: E^n \rightarrow E^n$  be continuous and locally Lipschitz at  $x = 0$ . If all solutions  $x(t)$  of (3), with  $x(0) \in E^n$ , satisfy  $x(t) \rightarrow 0$  as  $t \rightarrow \infty$ , then there exist constants  $\delta > 0$ ,  $M \geq 1$  and  $\rho > 1$  such that all solutions  $x(t)$  of (2), with  $|x(0)| < \delta$ , satisfy  $|x(t)| \leq M|x(0)|\rho^{-t}$ ,  $t \in N_0$ .*

**COROLLARY 2.** *Let  $f: E^n \rightarrow E^n$  be continuous and globally Lipschitz at  $x = 0$ . If all solutions  $x(t)$  of  $\Delta x(t) \in D_f^*(x(t-1))$ , with  $x(0) \in E^n$ , satisfy  $x(t) \rightarrow 0$  as  $t \rightarrow \infty$ , then there exist constants  $H \geq 1$  and  $\rho > 1$  such that all solutions  $x(t)$  of (2), with  $x(0) \in E^n$ , satisfy  $|x(t)| \leq H|x(0)|\rho^{-t}$ ,  $t \in N_0$ .*

From Lemma 2 and Corollary 1 we have:

**THEOREM 3.** *Let  $f: E^n \rightarrow E^n$  be continuous and locally Lipschitz at  $x = 0$  and assume that  $f$  has homogeneous differential  $h$  at  $x = 0$ .*

*If all solutions  $x(t)$  of*

$$(8) \quad \Delta x(t) = h(x(t-1)),$$

with  $x(0) \in E^n$ , satisfy  $x(t) \rightarrow 0$  as  $t \rightarrow \infty$ , then there exist constants  $\delta > 0$ ,  $M \geq 1$  and  $\rho > 1$  such that all solutions  $x(t)$  of (2), with  $|x(0)| < \delta$ , satisfy  $|x(t)| \leq M |x(0)| \rho^{-t}$ ,  $t \in N_0$ .

COROLLARY 3. Let  $f: E^n \rightarrow E^n$  be continuous and locally Lipschitz at  $x = 0$  and assume that  $f$  has Fréchet differential  $A$  at  $x = 0$ . Then, if all solutions  $x(t)$  of (1), with  $x(0) \in E^n$ , satisfy  $x(t) \rightarrow 0$  as  $t \rightarrow \infty$ , the conclusion of Theorem 3 holds.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] F. S. DE BLASI and J. SCHINAS, *Stability of multivalued discrete dynamical systems* «J. Differential Equations» (to appear).
- [2] W. HAHN, *Stability of motion*, Springer-Verlag, Berlin (1967).
- [3] A. LASOTA and A. STRAUSS, *Asymptotic behaviour for differential equations which cannot be locally linearized*, «J. Differential Equations», 10, 152-172 (1971).
- [4] G. P. SZEGÖ and G. TRECCANI, *An abstract formulation of minimization algorithms*, in «Differential games and related topics», Eds. H. W. Kuhn and G. P. Szegö, North-Holland, Amsterdam (1971).